

The Global Connections of Gandhāran Art

**Proceedings of the Third International
Workshop of the Gandhāra Connections Project,
University of Oxford, 18th-19th March, 2019**

Edited by
Wannaporn Rienjang
Peter Stewart



ARCHAEOPRESS PUBLISHING LTD

Summertown Pavilion
18-24 Middle Way
Summertown
Oxford OX2 7LG

www.archaeopress.com

ISBN 978-1-78969-695-0

ISBN 978-1-78969-696-7 (e-Pdf)

DOI: 10.32028/9781789696950

© Archaeopress and the individual authors 2020

All rights reserved. No part of this book may be reproduced or transmitted, in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying or otherwise, without the prior written permission of the copyright owners.

This book is available direct from Archaeopress or from our website www.archaeopress.com

Contents

Acknowledgements	iii
Illustrations	iii
Contributors	iv
Preface	vi
Wannaporn Rienjang and Peter Stewart	
Part 1 Global perspectives	
Gandhāra perceptions: the orbit of Gandhāran studies	1
Warwick Ball	
Part 2 The Graeco-Roman connection	
On the crossroads of disciplines: Tonio Hölscher’s theory of understanding Roman art images and its implications for the study of western influence(s) in Gandhāran art	29
Martina Stoye	
Roman sarcophagi and Gandhāran sculpture	50
Peter Stewart	
The transmission of Dionysiac imagery to Gandhāran Buddhist art	86
Tadashi Tanabe	
Part 3 Asian influences	
Buddha on the Rocks: Gandhāran connections through the Karakorum mountains.....	105
M. E. J. J. van Aerde, A. D. L. Mohns, and A. G. Khan	
Buddhist temples in Tukhāristān and their relationships with Gandhāran traditions.....	135
Shumpei Iwai	
More Gandhāra than Mathurā: substantial and persistent Gandhāran influences provincialized in the Buddhist material culture of Gujarat and beyond, c. AD 400-550.....	156
Ken Ishikawa	
Part 4 Gandhāra and China	
Cross-cultural Buddhist monastery ruins on the Silk Road and beyond: the layout and function of Buddhist monasteries reconsidered	207
Joy Yi Lidu	
The sinicization and secularization of some Graeco-Buddhist gods in China	234
Juping Yang	
Part 5 Epilogue	
De-fragmenting Gandhāran art: advancing analysis through digital imaging and visualization ...	251
Ian Haynes, Iwan Peverett, Wannaporn Rienjang with contributions by Luca M. Olivieri	

Acknowledgements

The Gandhāra Connections project could not exist without the generosity and collegiality of scholars from different countries and institutional contexts. This is especially true of the proceedings of the project's annual international workshops, which are produced on an extremely tight timetable and require from the contributors immense efforts of writing and sourcing of photographs. The editors are deeply grateful to all who have participated in this work and in the gathering of March 2019 which underpins the present volume.

This is the third of five projected sets of conference proceedings, which are intended to reach the widest possible audience through parallel print and online, open access editions. As always, we should like to thank David Davison and his colleagues at Archaeopress for making this demanding format successful, particularly in the challenging context of the Covid-19 restrictions of spring 2020. We are also most grateful to Sarah Knights Johnson for her assistance in checking the text before publication.

Above all, we should like to record our profound thanks to the supporters of Gandhāra Connections in its successive phases: the Bagri Foundation, Neil Kreitman, and Richard Beleson. Their generosity and enthusiasm have been fundamental to the whole initiative.

Illustrations

The contributing authors and editors have endeavoured to ensure that the images used in this open access, academic publication are available to be reproduced for academic purposes and, where required, that the necessary permissions have been obtained from copyright holders. If any omissions are brought to our notice we will be happy to include appropriate acknowledgement online or in any future edition.

Contributors

Marike van Aerde completed her doctoral degree from Leiden University, where she is now Researcher and Lecturer in Archaeology. Her research explores the archaeological evidence of trade routes connecting the Indian Subcontinent, East Africa, and the Mediterranean during the early first millennium AD. Her ongoing project, 'Routes of Exchange, Roots of Connectivity' focuses on the documentation and analysis of ancient rock carvings across the Karakorum mountain range in Pakistan (including ancient Buddhist rock art), the study of West Indian port sites, and the diversity of ceramics datasets from East Africa.

Warwick Ball has excavated in Iran, Afghanistan, Jordan, Iraq, Ethiopia, and Libya. Positions have included Acting Director of the British Institute of Afghan Studies, Director of Excavations at the British School of Archaeology in Iraq and Founder Editor of the journal *Afghanistan*. His publications include *Rome in the East: The Transformation of an Empire* (2000), *The Monuments of Afghanistan: History, Archaeology and Architecture* (2008), *Archaeological Gazetteer of Afghanistan* (Revised and updated edition, 2019), and, as co-author/editor, *The Archaeology of Afghanistan* (Revised and expanded edition, 2019). In 2020 he was awarded an honorary Doctorate of Letters by the University of St Andrews.

Ian Haynes received his doctorate from Oxford University, and has taught at Oxford, London and Newcastle Universities. He is now Professor of Archaeology at Newcastle University. He has a long-standing research interest in the archaeology of cult practice and has published widely on the topic. Ian is also an active proponent of visualization/provocation as a research vehicle and of the application of digital technologies to the study of antiquity. He formed NU Digital Heritage to advance the availability of laser and white light scan images to researchers. In 2019 he won an ERC Advanced Grant to pursue a major research project in Rome, 'Rome Transformed'.

Ken Ishikawa is a DPhil candidate in Archaeology at Wolfson College, University of Oxford. His dissertation focuses on Buddhist rock-cut caves and monasticism in Early Historic Gujarat.

Shumpei Iwai is Associate Professor of Archaeology at the Ryukoku University and Associate Curator of Central Asian Art at the Ryukoku Museum, Kyoto. His research interests focus on the archaeology of Central Asia during the first millennium AD. He has been actively involved in International Projects on Gandhāran and Central Asian Art including UNESCO funded projects for the preservation of the Buddhist Monastery of Ajina Tēpa in Tajikistan and the restoration and preservation of the Buddhist site of Bamiyan.

Abdul Ghani Khan completed his MA (Gold Medal) and MPhil degrees at Hazara University. His archaeological fieldwork and research focus on the study of ancient rock carvings, especially Buddhist carvings, from the Karakorum region of northern Pakistan, his home country. In collaboration with Marike van Aerde's research project at Leiden University, he is currently planning new fieldwork in Gilgit-Baltistan to preserve and study as yet unrecorded rock carvings.

Alexander Mohns conducted a comprehensive analysis of figurative Buddhist rock art from the Karakorum mountain range in Pakistan for his BA thesis, under the supervision of Marike van Aerde at Leiden University. His MA focuses on applied archaeological techniques in Sri Lanka, and he is collaborating with Van Aerde and Abdul Ghani Khan to prepare new fieldwork in Pakistan.

Luca M. Olivieri is Director of the ISMEO/Ca' Foscari Italian Archaeological Mission in Pakistan and Associate Professor of Archaeology and Cultures of Gandhāra and the Silk Roads at the Department of Asian and North African Studies of the Ca' Foscari University of Venice. He has been working in Swat for more than thirty years. His main long-lasting project is the ongoing excavations at the urban site of Bazira/Barikot. His principal interests include excavation, rock-art, and heritage management methodologies. In 2017 he was awarded with the *Sitara-i-Imtiaz* of Pakistan for his three decades of archaeological work in Swat.

Iwan Peverett is a Visiting Researcher at Newcastle University and Director of New Visions Heritage Ltd. His passion for developing the use of future technologies within the heritage sector has seen his work gain international recognition, published and featured in television programmes. Iwan has also been at the forefront of developing new work practices to assist in the integration of digital technologies and communication. He was a key member of the major urban model project team that received an award for technical innovation from BAFTA Scotland and the Merchant City Festival and he also conceived the initial concept as well as project-managing the delivery and digital elements of a project for the Samsung Digital Discovery Centre at the British Museum. This project was mentioned as an exemplar digital heritage project in the UK Government's Culture White Paper on Cultural Heritage.

Wannaporn Rienjang obtained her doctorate in Archaeology from University of Cambridge. She is now Lecturer in Archaeology, Museum and Heritage Studies at the Faculty of Sociology and Anthropology, Thammasat University and a project consultant for the Gandhāra Connections Project at the Classical Art Research Centre, Oxford. Her research focuses on the art and archaeology of Greater Gandhāra, Indian Ocean Trade and ancient working technologies of stone beads and vessels.

Peter Stewart is Director of the Classical Art Research Centre and Associate Professor of Classical Art and Archaeology at the University of Oxford. He has worked widely in the field of ancient sculpture. His publications include *Statues in Roman Society: Representation and Response* (2003) and *The Social History of Roman Art* (2008). Much of his research concerns the relationship between ancient art traditions, particularly between Gandhāran art and Roman sculpture.

Martina Stoye is Curator of South and South-East Asian Art at the Museum für Asiatische Kunst, Berlin. She studied Indology in Tübingen and Berlin, with specialization in the archaeology and history of art of South Asia. After graduating, she worked as a research associate for the history of Indian art at the Freie Universität Berlin as well as a project manager for several exhibitions in the context of the Festival of India in Germany. Much of her research concerns the relationship between Gandhāran Buddhavita scenes and Roman iconographies. In 2007/2008 she contributed to the Gandhāra exhibition at the Bundeskunsthalle Bonn. In her role as a museum curator she is in charge of a major Gandhāra collection.

Tadashi Tanabe is Research Fellow of the Japan Society for the Promotion of Science and the International Research Institute for Advanced Buddhology, Soka University, and Visiting Researcher at the Institut für Indologie und Tibetologie, Ludwig Maximilians Universität, Munich. His research focuses on Greek and Roman influence on Gandhāran art and the iconographical study of Gandhāran Buddhist relief panels. His monograph, *Courtesans in Gandhara* (in Japanese), is expected to be published in 2020.

Juping Yang is Professor of Ancient History and Director of the Center for Studies on Ancient Civilization on the Silk Road at Nankai University in Tianjin. He was a joint fellow of the Center for Hellenic Studies of Harvard University (CHS) and the German Archaeological Institute (DAI) in 2013-2014. He has published widely on the relationship between ancient China and the Graeco-Roman world and is currently director of the key project 'Hellenistic Civilization and the Silk Road', funded by the National Social Science Foundation of China.

Joy Lidu Yi obtained her PhD at the University of Toronto in Canada and is Associate Professor of Chinese art and archaeology at the College of Communication, Architecture and The Arts at Florida International University, Miami. She is particularly interested in image-making, religious space and liturgy of Buddhist sanctuaries on the Silk Road. She is the author of *Yungang: Art, History, Archaeology and Liturgy*, the first ever comprehensive examination in any western language, which provides a social art history of Yungang: a fifth-century rock-cut court cave complex, UNESCO World Heritage site, and one of the greatest Buddhist monuments of all time.

Preface

Wannaporn Rienjang and Peter Stewart

This volume presents the edited proceedings of the 2019 international workshop of the Gandhāra Connections Project at the University of Oxford's Classical Art Research Centre. For this, the third of the project's main annual conferences, we turned to a topic of fundamental importance for the understanding of Gandhāran art: the remarkable relationships of this regional tradition with the artistic currents of Asia and the Mediterranean. Naturally, these global connections constitute the point of departure for a project generated within a research centre that is principally dedicated to the art of the Graeco-Roman world.

The first two workshops addressed the chronology and the regional geography of Gandhāran art – topics that underlie any wider exploration of the world of Gandhāran art (Rienjang & Stewart 2018; Rienjang & Stewart 2019). The geographical and cultural scope of the current volume is very much broader. We are not only concerned with the 'influence' of Greece and Rome on Gandhāra, much though this has dominated the subject in the last 150 years, but also with the role of other parts of Central and South Asia, and notably with the rich legacy of Gandhāra itself as it contributed to the development of art in China and beyond.

Gandhāran art was created in a region that has been called the 'Crossroads of Asia', an area emblematic of cross-cultural connections and global links in antiquity. Of course, that reputation partly reflects our very modern concerns.¹ In an era of globalization and global communication (never mind the imperial environment in which Gandhāran art was rediscovered), it has been tempting to invent this tradition in our own, modern image. Nevertheless, by any standards, the extent to which the artists and patrons of Buddhist Gandhāra borrowed from and influenced other cultures and lands is quite remarkable. In the last thirty years or so, a consensus has emerged that Gandhāran art drew upon a variety of artistic repertoires – Greek, Roman, Parthian/Persian, and Indian. A more sophisticated appreciation of the complexity of Gandhāran sculpture has emerged as a result; for example, there is greater interest in the complicated relationship of Gandhāran art with India, and even perhaps with the classical world through India. This awareness of multiple inter-cultural links, replacing a presumed binary, linear relationship with the classical world (with the 'West', as it is often misleadingly called), has been neatly summarized by Michael Falser, who describes it as a 'new post-partition pluralistic tendency', associating its origins particularly with the work of Mortimer Wheeler and Maurizio Taddei (Falser 2015; see also Stewart's contribution to this volume). The vision of Gandhāran art as a confluence of styles and iconographies has been presented in some detail by perhaps the last major monograph on the subject, Lolita Nehru's *Origins of the Gandhāran Style: A Study of Contributory Influences*, which was published in 1989.

In Falser's view, Taddei's work contributed to the pluralization and diversification of Gandhāra's position in the global history of art, releasing it from some of the ideological assumptions that hitherto prevailed. But importantly he advocates a more subtle and critical approach to Gandhāran art, which is perhaps impeded even by pluralistic cultural labelling. That is to say, applying a range of alternative labels – Greek, Parthian, Indian, etc. – can have its pitfalls as well. Falser makes a contrast between global history of art and world art history. Global art history is an approach that questions classifications and emphasizes transcultural processes. In contrast, traditional world art history is an additive container

¹ The modern filters that help to determine our vision of Gandhāra are part of the subject of our fourth workshop, originally planned for March 2020 (but delayed to 2021): 'The Rediscovery and Reception of Gandhāran Art'.

which expands to include other cultures and approaches rather than thinking about the dynamic processes of interaction between them. To think in terms of global art history, inevitably means trying to evade from some of the constraints posed, even subconsciously, by cultural nomenclature. It is impossible to escape those names altogether and they will frequently be encountered in this volume. As far as possible, however, we need to keep in mind that they largely are modern inventions, impositions on the ancient material. The interconnected world of ancient art that is the matrix for the studies presented here constantly resists easy classification.

The application of the term 'globalization' to the ancient world is controversial and in various respects anachronistic. Nevertheless, our modern, everyday experience of globalization, should at least help us to recognize the conceptual challenges that the global movements of culture pose. The 'English' language, like fine 'china', or the ubiquitously consumed Coca Cola, are rooted in their countries of origin but have a global life of their own. Just so, to think of Gandhāran art only in terms of East and West, or Greekness and Romanness, or hybridity (Graeco-Buddhist, Indo-Parthian) would be forcefully reductive.

The purpose of this book is neither to explore ancient globalization nor global ancient art and it deals head-on with some of the traditional cultural relationships that have defined the past study of Gandhāran art, especially, in fact, the artists' appropriation of the classical tradition and some of the very direct connections which appear to have existed across vast distances of the ancient world. None the less, the examples and arguments presented here should be viewed against the background of an ancient world whose complexity defies any straightforward 'story of art'.

References

- Falser M. 2015. The *Graeco-Buddhist Style of Gandhara* - a 'Storia Ideologica', or: How a Discourse Makes a Global History of Art. *Journal of Art Historiography* 13: 1-52.
- Nehru L. 1989. *Origins of the Gandhāran Style: A Study of Contributory Influences*. Delhi: Oxford University Press.
- Rienjang W. and Stewart P. (eds), 2018. *Problems of Chronology in Gandhāran Art: Proceedings of the First International Workshop of the Gandhāra Connections Project, University of Oxford, 23rd-24th March, 2017*. Oxford: Archaeopress.
- Rienjang W. and Stewart P. (eds), 2019. *The Geography of Gandhāran Art: Proceedings of the Second International Workshop of the Gandhāra Connections Project, University of Oxford, 22nd-23rd March, 2018*. Oxford: Archaeopress.